

# AN ELEMENTARY AND CONSTRUCTIVE SOLUTION TO HILBERT'S 17TH PROBLEM FOR MATRICES

CHRISTOPHER J. HILLAR AND JIAWANG NIE

**ABSTRACT.** We give a short and elementary proof of a theorem of Procesi, Schacher and (independently) Gondard, Ribenboim that generalizes a famous result of Artin. Let  $A$  be an  $n \times n$  symmetric matrix with entries in the polynomial ring  $\mathbb{R}[x_1, \dots, x_m]$ . The result is that if  $A$  is positive semidefinite for all substitutions  $(x_1, \dots, x_m) \in \mathbb{R}^m$ , then  $A$  can be expressed as a sum of squares of symmetric matrices with entries in  $\mathbb{R}(x_1, \dots, x_m)$ . Moreover, our proof is constructive and gives explicit representations modulo the scalar case.

We shall give an elementary proof of the following theorem. Recall that a real matrix is *positive semidefinite* if it is symmetric with all nonnegative eigenvalues.

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $A$  be a symmetric matrix with entries in  $\mathbb{R}[x_1, \dots, x_m]$ . If  $A$  is positive semidefinite for all substitutions  $(x_1, \dots, x_m) \in \mathbb{R}^m$ , then  $A$  can be expressed as a sum of squares of symmetric matrices with entries in  $\mathbb{R}(x_1, \dots, x_m)$ .*

This generalizes the following famous result of Artin on nonnegative polynomials; it is the starting point for a large body of work relating positivity and algebra.

**Theorem 2** (Artin). *If  $f \in \mathbb{R}[x_1, \dots, x_n]$  is nonnegative for all substitutions  $(x_1, \dots, x_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , then  $f$  is a sum of squares of rational functions in  $\mathbb{R}(x_1, \dots, x_n)$ .*

Theorem 1 was originally proved in [3] and (within a general framework) in [7], although a formulation involving elements in a number field was already considered in [2]. Like Artin's result, it guarantees algebraic certificates to (matrix) nonnegativity. However, the known proofs are nonconstructive, employing either model theory [3] or ultraproducts [7]. In contrast, we use only basic facts about real closed fields and linear algebra to give an explicit and elegant proof of Theorem 1.

Recall that a field  $F$  is *real* if  $-1$  is not a sum of squares in  $F$ , and a *real closed field*  $R$  is a real field such that any algebraic extension of  $R$  that is real must be equal to  $R$ . Real closed fields have a unique ordering, the nonnegative elements being the squares. For instance,  $\mathbb{R}(x_1, \dots, x_m)$  is a real field and  $\mathbb{R}$  is real closed. A *principal minor* of a matrix is a determinant of a submatrix determined by the same row and column indices. The set of symmetric matrices over  $\mathbb{R}$  with all principal minors nonnegative coincides with the set of positive semidefinite matrices (see for example [4, p. 405]), a fundamental relationship we exploit below. We will prove the following generalization of Theorem 1 to the setting of real fields.

---

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 12D15, 03C64, 13L05, 14P05, 15A21, 15A54.

*Key words and phrases.* Artin's theorem, Hilbert's 17th problem, sums of squares, positive semidefinite matrix, real closed field.

The first author is supported under an NSF Postdoctoral Research Fellowship. This research was conducted during the *Positive Polynomials and Optimization* workshop at the Banff International Research Station, October 7–12 (2006), Banff, Canada.

**Theorem 3.** *Let  $F$  be a real field and let  $A$  be a symmetric matrix with entries in  $F$ . If the principal minors of  $A$  can be expressed as sums of squares in  $F$ , then  $A$  is a sum of squares of symmetric matrices with entries in  $F$ .*

To see how Theorem 1 follows from Theorem 3, consider a principal minor  $p(x_1, \dots, x_m) \in \mathbb{R}[x_1, \dots, x_m]$  of the matrix  $A$ . By assumption, it will be nonnegative for all substitutions  $(x_1, \dots, x_m) \in \mathbb{R}^m$ , and therefore, Artin's theorem implies that it is a sum of squares of rational functions. We may now invoke Theorem 3.

As another application, consider positive semidefinite matrices  $A \in \mathbb{Q}^{n \times n}$ . Standard matrix theory allows one to write  $A = B^2$  for a symmetric  $B$  with entries that are algebraic numbers; however, Theorem 3 tells us that  $A$  is actually a sum of squares of rational matrices. This follows since any nonnegative rational number  $a/b = ab/b^2$  can be written as a sum of four rational squares by Lagrange's theorem.

To prove Theorem 3, we begin with a lemma. For the basic theory of real closed fields (RCF) we will need, we refer the reader to [5, 6]. The main observation is that a symmetric matrix  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  that has all nonnegative principal minors is diagonalizable over  $\mathbb{R}$  with nonnegative eigenvalues, just as is the case for  $\mathbb{R}$ .

**Lemma 4.** *Suppose that  $A$  satisfies the statement of Theorem 3. Then the minimal polynomial  $p(t) \in F[t]$  of  $A$  is of the form:*

$$p(t) = \sum_{i=0}^m (-1)^{m-i} a_i t^i = t^m - a_{m-1} t^{m-1} + \dots + (-1)^m a_0$$

for  $a_i$  that are sums of squares of elements of  $F$ . Moreover,  $a_1 \neq 0$ .

*Proof.* Express the minimal polynomial of  $A$  as in the statement of the theorem. We first make the following observation. Let  $R$  be any real closure of  $F$ ; this induces an ordering on  $R$ , in which the principal minors of  $A$  are nonnegative (they are sums of squares). Since  $A$  is diagonalizable over  $R$  and has nonnegative eigenvalues, it follows that each  $a_i \geq 0$  and also that  $p(t)$  has no repeated roots.

Suppose now that some  $a_i$  was not a sum of squares in  $F$ . Then there is an ordering of  $F$  with  $a_i$  negative. Let  $R$  be a real closure of  $F$  that extends the ordering on  $F$ . By above,  $a_i$  is nonnegative, a contradiction. To verify the second claim, first notice that  $t^2$  does not divide  $p(t)$  so that  $a_0$  and  $a_1$  cannot both be 0. In a real closure of  $F$ , the coefficient  $a_1$  is a sum of products of (nonnegative) roots of  $p(t)$ . It follows that if  $a_1 = 0$ , we have  $(-1)^m a_0 = p(0) = 0$ . Thus,  $a_1 \neq 0$ .  $\square$

*Proof of Theorem 3.* Let  $A$  be a symmetric matrix satisfying the hypotheses of the theorem. Also, let  $p(t)$  be the minimal polynomial for  $A$ , which has the form prescribed by Lemma 4. For notational simplicity, we assume that  $m$  is odd, although the argument is the same when  $m$  is even. Since  $p(A) = 0$ , it follows that

$$(A^{m-1} + a_{m-2}A^{m-3} + \dots + a_1I)A = a_{m-1}A^{m-1} + a_{m-3}A^{m-3} + \dots + a_0I.$$

Set  $B = A^{m-1} + \dots + a_1I$ , which is invertible (since  $a_1 \neq 0$ , in any real closure of  $F$ , it is diagonalizable with strictly positive eigenvalues). Therefore, we have

$$(1) \quad A = B \cdot (a_{m-1}B^{-2}A^{m-1} + a_{m-3}B^{-2}A^{m-3} + \dots + a_0B^{-2}).$$

Since  $B$  is a sum of squares and  $B$  and  $B^{-1}$  commute with  $A$ , the result follows.  $\square$

Notice that our argument gives a commuting sum of squares representation, the existence of which was also observed in [7]. We close with two examples to illustrate the construction from our proof.

**Example 5.** The following symmetric matrix is always positive semidefinite:

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & x_1x_2 \\ x_1x_2 & 1 + x_1^4x_2^2 + x_1^2x_2^4 \end{bmatrix}.$$

However, it is not a sum of squares of matrix polynomials. To see this, let  $\mathbf{x} = [1, -1]^T$  and suppose that  $A$  is a sum of polynomial squares; then so is the polynomial  $f(x_1, x_2) = \mathbf{x}^T A \mathbf{x} = 2 + x_1^4x_2^2 + x_1^2x_2^4 - 2x_1x_2$ . Thus, we can express  $f = \sum_{i=1}^n p_i^2$  for some polynomials  $p_i$  with  $\deg(p_i) \leq 3$ . Comparing coefficients,  $p_i$  cannot contain the monomials  $x_1^3, x_2^3, x_1^2, x_2^2, x_1x_2, x_1$ , or  $x_2$  so that we can write  $p_i = a_i + b_ix_1^2x_2 + c_ix_1x_2^2$  for some  $a_i, b_i, c_i \in \mathbb{R}$ . However, then we cannot produce the term  $-2x_1x_2$  in  $f$ , a contradiction. Similarly,  $\det(A)$  is not a sum of polynomial squares. It is, however, a sum of rational squares since  $(x_1^2 + x_2^2)\det(A)$  equals:

$$\begin{aligned} & \left(x_2 - \frac{1}{2}x_1^2x_2\right)^2 + \left(x_1 - \frac{1}{2}x_1x_2^2\right)^2 + 2\left(x_1x_2 - \frac{1}{2}x_1x_2^3 - \frac{1}{2}x_1^3x_2\right)^2 + \\ & \frac{3}{4}(x_1^2x_2^4 + x_1^4x_2^2) + \frac{1}{2}(x_1x_2^3 + x_1^3x_2)^2. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $A^2 - \operatorname{tr}(A)A + \det(A)I = 0$ , we have the rational squares representation:

$$A = \operatorname{tr}(A) \left[ (\operatorname{tr}(A)^{-1}A)^2 + \det(A) (\operatorname{tr}(A)^{-1}I)^2 \right]. \quad \square$$

**Example 6.** The following matrix is positive semidefinite for all substitutions:

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} x_1^2 + 2x_3^2 & -x_1x_2 & -x_1x_3 \\ -x_1x_2 & x_2^2 + 2x_1^2 & -x_2x_3 \\ -x_1x_3 & -x_2x_3 & x_3^2 + 2x_2^2 \end{bmatrix},$$

but it is not a sum of polynomial squares [1]. Its minimal polynomial has coefficients

$$\begin{aligned} a_2 &= 3x_3^2 + 3x_2^2 + 3x_1^2, \quad a_1 = 2x_2^4 + 6x_1^2x_3^2 + 6x_1^2x_2^2 + 2x_1^4 + 2x_3^4 + 6x_2^2x_3^2, \\ a_0 &= 4x_1^4x_2^2 + 4x_3^2x_2^4 + 4x_3^2x_1^2 + 4x_3^2x_1^2x_2^2, \end{aligned}$$

which are all sums of squares. From formula (1), we have

$$A = (A^2 + a_1I) \left[ a_2 (A + a_1A^{-1})^{-2} + a_0 (A^2 + a_1I)^{-2} \right]. \quad \square$$

We would like to thank Konrad Schmüdgen for discussing this problem with us.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] M.-D. Choi, *Positive semidefinite biquadratic forms*, Lin. Alg. Appl., **12** (1975) 95–100.
- [2] R. Ciampi, *Characterization of a class of matrices as sums of squares*, Lin. Alg. Appl, **3** (1970) 45–50.
- [3] D. Gondard, P. Ribenboim, *Le 17e problème de Hilbert pour les matrices*, Bull. Sci. Math., **98** (1974) 49–56.
- [4] R. Horn and C. R. Johnson, *Matrix analysis*, Cambridge University Press, New York, 1985.
- [5] S. Lang, *Algebra -3rd ed*, Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, New York, 1993.
- [6] D. Marker, *Model Theory: an Introduction*, Springer Verlag, 2002.
- [7] C. Procesi, M. Schacher, *A Non-Commutative Real Nullstellensatz and Hilbert's 17th Problem*, Annals of Mathematics, **104** (1976) 395–406.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY, COLLEGE STATION, TX 77843.  
E-mail address: [chillar@math.tamu.edu](mailto:chillar@math.tamu.edu)

INSTITUTE FOR MATHEMATICS AND ITS APPLICATIONS, UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA, MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55455.  
E-mail address: [njw@ima.umn.edu](mailto:njw@ima.umn.edu)